

CHARACTERIZATION OF MAJORIZATION IN l^1

G Sankara Raju Kosuru

raju@iitrpr.ac.in

Department Of Mathematics
IIT Ropar



15th Decemberr 2018

Recent Advances in Operator Theory and Operator Algebras (OTOA-2018)

Indian Statistical Institute, Bangalore

Majorization

- Suppose $x, y \in \mathbb{R}^n$. Then x is said to be majorized by y if

$$\sum_{i=1}^k x_i^\downarrow \leq \sum_{i=1}^k y_i^\downarrow \quad \text{for } 1 \leq k \leq n-1 \text{ and}$$

$$\sum_{i=1}^n x_i = \sum_{i=1}^n y_i.$$

- $x \preceq y$

Characterizations of Majorization

Let $x, y \in \mathbb{R}^n$.

Characterizations of Majorization

Let $x, y \in \mathbb{R}^n$. Then

- ① **Hardy, Littlewood and Pólya Theorem [4]** $x \preceq y$ if and only if $x = Dy$ for some doubly stochastic matrix D .

Characterizations of Majorization

Let $x, y \in \mathbb{R}^n$. Then

- 1 **Hardy, Littlewood and Pólya Theorem [4]** $x \preceq y$ if and only if $x = Dy$ for some doubly stochastic matrix D .
- 2 **Horn Theorem [5]** $x \preceq y$ if and only if $x = Qy$ for some orthostochastic matrix Q . A square matrix Q is said to be orthostochastic matrix if it is Schur-square of a orthogonal matrix i.e. $Q = (Q_{ij}) = (U_{ij}^2)$, where U is a orthogonal matrix.

Characterizations of Majorization

Let $x, y \in \mathbb{R}^n$. Then

- 1 **Hardy, Littlewood and Pólya Theorem [4]** $x \preceq y$ if and only if $x = Dy$ for some doubly stochastic matrix D .
- 2 **Horn Theorem [5]** $x \preceq y$ if and only if $x = Qy$ for some orthostochastic matrix Q . A square matrix Q is said to be orthostochastic matrix if it is Schur-square of a orthogonal matrix i.e. $Q = (Q_{ij}) = (U_{ij}^2)$, where U is a orthogonal matrix.
- 3 **Schur-Horn Theorem [5]** Given a self-adjoint $n \times n$ matrix H having eigenvalue list in y , there is a basis for which H has diagonal entries x if and only if $x \preceq y$.

Characterizations of Majorization

Let $x, y \in \mathbb{R}^n$. Then

- ① **Hardy, Littlewood and Pólya Theorem [4]** $x \preceq y$ if and only if $x = Dy$ for some doubly stochastic matrix D .
- ② **Horn Theorem [5]** $x \preceq y$ if and only if $x = Qy$ for some orthostochastic matrix Q . A square matrix Q is said to be orthostochastic matrix if it is Schur-square of a orthogonal matrix i.e. $Q = (Q_{ij}) = (U_{ij}^2)$, where U is a orthogonal matrix.
- ③ **Schur-Horn Theorem [5]** Given a self-adjoint $n \times n$ matrix H having eigenvalue list in y , there is a basis for which H has diagonal entries x if and only if $x \preceq y$.
- ④ $x \preceq y$ if and only if $\sum_{j=1}^n g(x_j) \leq \sum_{j=1}^n g(y_j)$ for any convex function g on \mathbb{R} [4].

Aim

Look for characterizations of majorization in the infinite spaces, more precisely on the absolutely summable sequence space l^1 .

Aim

Look for characterizations of majorization in the infinite spaces, more precisely on the absolutely summable sequence space l^1 .

Theorem (Existing results)

- ➊ *Markus in [2] proved Hardy-Littlewood-Pólya type theorem for monotonically decreasing sequences in l^1 .*

Aim

Look for characterizations of majorization in the infinite spaces, more precisely on the absolutely summable sequence space l^1 .

Theorem (Existing results)

- 1 *Markus in [2] proved Hardy-Littlewood-Pólya type theorem for monotonically decreasing sequences in l^1 .*
- 2 *Markus et. al. in [3] proved Schur-Horn theorem for monotonically decreasing sequences in l^1 for any two elements in the positive cone in l^1 .*

Aim

Look for characterizations of majorization in the infinite spaces, more precisely on the absolutely summable sequence space l^1 .

Theorem (Existing results)

- 1 *Markus in [2] proved Hardy-Littlewood-Pólya type theorem for monotonically decreasing sequences in l^1 .*
- 2 *Markus et. al. in [3] proved Schur-Horn theorem for monotonically decreasing sequences in l^1 for any two elements in the positive cone in l^1 .*
- 3 *Arveson and Kadison[3] obtained other characterizations in using different methods, in a similar kind of settings.*

Aim

Look for characterizations of majorization in the infinite spaces, more precisely on the absolutely summable sequence space l^1 .

Theorem (Existing results)

- 1 *Markus in [2] proved Hardy-Littlewood-Pólya type theorem for monotonically decreasing sequences in l^1 .*
- 2 *Markus et. al. in [3] proved Schur-Horn theorem for monotonically decreasing sequences in l^1 for any two elements in the positive cone in l^1 .*
- 3 *Arveson and Kadison[3] obtained other characterizations in using different methods, in a similar kind of settings.*
- 4 *More recently, Kafal and Weiss [6] established infinite dimensional Schur-Horn theorem for sequences decreasing monotonically to zero.*

Notations

Let $a, b \in \mathbb{R}$. Define $a \vee b = \max\{a, b\}$.

The positive part of a (denoted by a^+) is $a \vee 0$, and

Notations

Let $a, b \in \mathbb{R}$. Define $a \vee b = \max\{a, b\}$.

The positive part of a (denoted by a^+) is $a \vee 0$, and
the negative part of a (denoted by a^-) is $-a \vee 0$.

Notations

Let $a, b \in \mathbb{R}$. Define $a \vee b = \max\{a, b\}$.

The positive part of a (denoted by a^+) is $a \vee 0$, and

the negative part of a (denoted by a^-) is $-a \vee 0$.

Let $\xi = \{\xi_j\} \in l^1$, the positive part of the sequence ξ is $\xi^+ = (\xi_1^+, \xi_2^+, \dots)$

and

the negative part of the sequence ξ is $\xi^- = (\xi_1^-, \xi_2^-, \dots)$.

Notations

Let $a, b \in \mathbb{R}$. Define $a \vee b = \max\{a, b\}$.

The positive part of a (denoted by a^+) is $a \vee 0$, and

the negative part of a (denoted by a^-) is $-a \vee 0$.

Let $\xi = \{\xi_j\} \in l^1$, the positive part of the sequence ξ is $\xi^+ = (\xi_1^+, \xi_2^+, \dots)$

and

the negative part of the sequence ξ is $\xi^- = (\xi_1^-, \xi_2^-, \dots)$.

Let $\xi^{+\downarrow} = (\xi_1^{+\downarrow}, \xi_2^{+\downarrow}, \dots)$ and $\xi^{-\downarrow} = (\xi_1^{-\downarrow}, \xi_2^{-\downarrow}, \dots)$, where

$\xi_1^{+\downarrow} \geq \xi_2^{+\downarrow} \geq \dots$ is the decreasing rearrangement of components of the sequence ξ^+ and

$\xi_1^{-\downarrow} \geq \xi_2^{-\downarrow} \geq \dots$ is the decreasing rearrangement of components of the sequence ξ^- .

Notations

Let $a, b \in \mathbb{R}$. Define $a \vee b = \max\{a, b\}$.

The positive part of a (denoted by a^+) is $a \vee 0$, and

the negative part of a (denoted by a^-) is $-a \vee 0$.

Let $\xi = \{\xi_j\} \in l^1$, the positive part of the sequence ξ is $\xi^+ = (\xi_1^+, \xi_2^+, \dots)$
and

the negative part of the sequence ξ is $\xi^- = (\xi_1^-, \xi_2^-, \dots)$.

Let $\xi^{+\downarrow} = (\xi_1^{+\downarrow}, \xi_2^{+\downarrow}, \dots)$ and $\xi^{-\downarrow} = (\xi_1^{-\downarrow}, \xi_2^{-\downarrow}, \dots)$, where

$\xi_1^{+\downarrow} \geq \xi_2^{+\downarrow} \geq \dots$ is the decreasing rearrangement of components of the sequence ξ^+ and

$\xi_1^{-\downarrow} \geq \xi_2^{-\downarrow} \geq \dots$ is the decreasing rearrangement of components of the sequence ξ^- .

Without loss of generality, we redefine ξ^+ by $\xi^{+\downarrow}$ and ξ^- by $\xi^{-\downarrow}$.

Majorization in l^1

Definition

Let $\xi = \{\xi_j\}$ and $\eta = \{\eta_j\}$ be two non-negative sequences in l^1 . We say that ξ is weakly majorized by η if

$$\sup_{\pi} \sum_{j=1}^k \xi_{\pi(j)} \leq \sup_{\pi} \sum_{j=1}^k \eta_{\pi(j)}$$

for $k \in \mathbb{N}$, where π is a permutation on \mathbb{N} . We denote it by $\xi \prec_w \eta$

Majorization in l^1

Definition

Let $\xi = \{\xi_j\}$ and $\eta = \{\eta_j\}$ be two non-negative sequences in l^1 . We say that ξ is weakly majorized by η if $\sup_{\pi} \sum_{j=1}^k \xi_{\pi(j)} \leq \sup_{\pi} \sum_{j=1}^k \eta_{\pi(j)}$ for $k \in \mathbb{N}$, where π is a permutation on \mathbb{N} . We denote it by $\xi \prec_w \eta$.

Definition

Let $\xi = \{\xi_j\}$ and $\eta = \{\eta_j\}$ be two sequences in l^1 . We say that ξ is majorized by η if $\xi^+ \prec_w \eta^+$, $\xi^- \prec_w \eta^-$ and $\sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \xi_j = \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \eta_j$. We denote it by $\xi \preceq \eta$.

Majorization in l^1

Definition

Let $\xi = \{\xi_j\}$ and $\eta = \{\eta_j\}$ be two non-negative sequences in l^1 . We say that ξ is weakly majorized by η if $\sup_{\pi} \sum_{j=1}^k \xi_{\pi(j)} \leq \sup_{\pi} \sum_{j=1}^k \eta_{\pi(j)}$ for $k \in \mathbb{N}$, where π is a permutation on \mathbb{N} . We denote it by $\xi \prec_w \eta$.

Definition

Let $\xi = \{\xi_j\}$ and $\eta = \{\eta_j\}$ be two sequences in l^1 . We say that ξ is majorized by η if $\xi^+ \prec_w \eta^+$, $\xi^- \prec_w \eta^-$ and $\sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \xi_j = \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \eta_j$. We denote it by $\xi \preceq \eta$.

Let $x = (x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n) \in \mathbb{R}^n$. One can think x as a sequence of l^1 by setting $x_k = 0$ for all $k > n$.

Let $x = (x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n)$ and $y = (y_1, y_2, \dots, y_n)$ be two elements in \mathbb{R}^n . Then $x \preceq y$ if and only if $x \prec y$.

Definition

Let $\eta \in l^1$. Then η is said to be pure if η^- and η^+ both either in c_{00} or not in c_{00} , where c_{00} denotes the space of all finite sequences.

Definition

Let $\eta \in l^1$. Then η is said to be pure if η^- and η^+ both either in c_{00} or not in c_{00} , where c_{00} denotes the space of all finite sequences.

Theorem (A)

Let H be a self-adjoint operator on a separable Hilbert space K and $\xi = \{\xi_j\} \in l^1$. Suppose $\eta = \{\eta_j\} \in l^1$ is the eigenspectrum of H and pure. If $\xi \preceq \eta$, then there exists an orthonormal basis of K which is the union of $\{\phi_j\}_{j=1}^\infty$ and $\{f_j\}_{j=1}^m$ ($0 \leq m \leq \infty$) such that $\langle H\phi_j, \phi_j \rangle = \xi_j$ for $j \in \mathbb{N}$ and $\langle Hf_j, f_j \rangle = 0$ for $j = 1, 2, 3, \dots, m$.

Schur-Horn type theorem

Theorem (B)

Let K be a separable Hilbert space and $\xi, \eta \in l_1$. Suppose η is pure. If $\xi \preceq \eta$, then there exists an orthonormal basis of K which is the union of $\{\phi_j\}_{j=1}^\infty$ and $\{f_j\}_{j=1}^m$ ($0 \leq m \leq \infty$) and a self-adjoint compact operator H on K such that $\{\eta_j : j \in \mathbb{N}\}$ is the eigenspectrum of H and $\langle H\phi_j, \phi_j \rangle = \xi_j$ for $j \in \mathbb{N}$, $\langle Hf_j, f_j \rangle = 0$ for $j = 1, 2, \dots, m$.

Schur-Horn type theorem

Theorem (B)

Let K be a separable Hilbert space and $\xi, \eta \in l_1$. Suppose η is pure. If $\xi \preceq \eta$, then there exists an orthonormal basis of K which is the union of $\{\phi_j\}_{j=1}^\infty$ and $\{f_j\}_{j=1}^m$ ($0 \leq m \leq \infty$) and a self-adjoint compact operator H on K such that $\{\eta_j : j \in \mathbb{N}\}$ is the eigenspectrum of H and $\langle H\phi_j, \phi_j \rangle = \xi_j$ for $j \in \mathbb{N}$, $\langle Hf_j, f_j \rangle = 0$ for $j = 1, 2, \dots, m$.

Proof: Let $\{\psi_j\}_{j=1}^\infty$ be any orthonormal basis of K . Let

$$H(x) = \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \eta_j \langle x, \psi_j \rangle \psi_j \text{ for all } x \in K.$$

- H is bounded, self-adjoint and compact operator on K .
- $\{\eta_j : j \in \mathbb{N}\}$ is the eigenspectrum of H .

The proof of the theorem follows from Theorem(A).

Hardy-Littlewood-pólya type theorem

Let $\xi = \{\xi_j\} \in l^1$. Denote a new sequence $\widehat{\xi} := \{\widehat{\xi}_j\}$ by including finite or infinite number of zeros as components in the sequence ξ .

Theorem

Let $\xi = \{\xi_j\}, \eta = \{\eta_j\} \in l^1$ and η is pure. Then $\xi \preceq \eta$ iff $\widehat{\xi} = M\eta$ for some infinite matrix $M = (m_{ij})$, with $m_{ij} \geq 0$ and $\sum_{j=1}^{\infty} m_{ij} = 1, \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} m_{ij} = 1$ for $i, j \in \mathbb{N}$, where $\widehat{\xi}$ is defined above

Hardy-Littlewood-pólya type theorem

Let $\xi = \{\xi_j\} \in l^1$. Denote a new sequence $\widehat{\xi} := \{\widehat{\xi}_j\}$ by including finite or infinite number of zeros as components in the sequence ξ .

Theorem

Let $\xi = \{\xi_j\}, \eta = \{\eta_j\} \in l^1$ and η is pure. Then $\xi \preceq \eta$ iff $\widehat{\xi} = M\eta$ for some infinite matrix $M = (m_{ij})$, with $m_{ij} \geq 0$ and $\sum_{j=1}^{\infty} m_{ij} = 1, \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} m_{ij} = 1$ for $i, j \in \mathbb{N}$,

where $\widehat{\xi}$ is defined above

Proof: Assume that $\xi \preceq \eta$.

Let K be a separable Hilbert space with an orthonormal basis $\{\psi_j : j \in \mathbb{N}\}$.

Then there exists a self-adjoint, compact operator H and an orthonormal basis $\{\phi_j\}_{j=1}^{\infty} \cup \{f_j\}_{j=1}^m$ such that $\{\eta_j : j \in \mathbb{N}\}$ is the eigenspectrum of H and $\langle H\phi_j, \phi_j \rangle = \xi_j$ for $j \in \mathbb{N}$, $\langle Hf_j, f_j \rangle = 0$ for $j = 1, 2, \dots, m$.

Proof cont...

- Denote $\{\phi'_j\}_{j=1}^\infty = \{\phi_j\}_{j=1}^\infty \cup \{f_j\}_{j=1}^m$
- $U(\psi_j) = \phi'_j$ for $j \in \mathbb{N}$.

Then

$$\widehat{\xi}_j = \langle H\phi'_j, \phi'_j \rangle = \langle H(U\psi_j), U\psi_j \rangle = \left\langle \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \eta_k \langle U\psi_j, \psi_k \rangle \psi_k, U\psi_j \right\rangle.$$

Hence

$$\widehat{\xi}_j = \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \eta_k \langle U\psi_j, \psi_k \rangle \langle \psi_k, U\psi_j \rangle = \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \eta_k |\langle U\psi_j, \psi_k \rangle|^2.$$

Set $m_{jk} = |\langle U\psi_j, \psi_k \rangle|^2$ for $j, k \in \mathbb{N}$. Then $m_{jk} \geq 0$ and $\widehat{\xi} = M\eta$, where $M = (m_{ij})$.

Proof cont...

Conversely, let $\widehat{\xi} = M\eta$.

$$\begin{aligned}
 \sum_{j=1}^n \widehat{\xi}_j^+ &= \sum_{j=1}^N \widehat{\xi}_j^+ = \sum_{j=1}^N \xi_j = \sum_{j=1}^N \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} m_{jk} \eta_k \\
 &\leq \sum_{j=1}^N \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} m_{j2k} \eta_k^+ = \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \sum_{j=1}^N m_{j2k} \eta_k^+ \\
 &= \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} S_k \eta_k^+, \quad \text{where } S_k = \sum_{j=1}^N m_{j2k} \\
 &\leq \sum_{k=1}^{N-1} S_k \eta_k^+ + \sum_{k=N}^{\infty} S_k \eta_N^+ \\
 &\leq \sum_{k=1}^{N-1} S_k \eta_k^+ + \left(N - \sum_{k=1}^{N-1} S_k \right) \eta_N^+ \leq \sum_{k=1}^n \eta_k^+.
 \end{aligned}$$

So $\widehat{\xi}^+ \prec_w \eta^+$. Similarly $\widehat{\xi}^- \prec_w \eta^-$. Also $\sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \widehat{\xi}_j = \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \eta_k$. Hence $\widehat{\xi} \preceq \eta$.

Relations between majorization in l^1 and convex function.

Theorem

Let $\xi = \{\xi_j\}, \eta = \{\eta_j\} \in l^1$ and η is pure. Assume that $\xi \preceq \eta$. Suppose $g : \mathbb{R} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ is a continuous convex function. Then the following hold.

- 1 If $\{g(\eta_j)\} \in l_1$, then $\sum_{j=1}^{\infty} g(\xi_j) \leq \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} g(\eta_j)$.

Relations between majorization in l^1 and convex function.

Theorem

Let $\xi = \{\xi_j\}, \eta = \{\eta_j\} \in l^1$ and η is pure. Assume that $\xi \preceq \eta$. Suppose $g : \mathbb{R} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ is a continuous convex function. Then the following hold.

- ① If $\{g(\eta_j)\} \in l_1$, then $\sum_{j=1}^{\infty} g(\xi_j) \leq \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} g(\eta_j)$.
- ② If $g(\eta_j)$'s has same sign except finitely many, then $\sum_{j=1}^{\infty} g(\widehat{\xi}_j) \leq \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} g(\eta_j)$,
where $\widehat{\xi} = \{\widehat{\xi}_j\}$ defined above.

Characterization of majorization in l^1

Theorem

Let $\alpha = \{\alpha_j\}, \beta = \{\beta_j\} \in l^1$. Then the following are equivalent

① $\alpha \preceq \beta$

② $\sum_{j=1}^{\infty} (\alpha_j - t)^+ \leq \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} (\beta_j - t)^+, \quad \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} (t - \alpha_j)^+ \leq \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} (t - \beta_j)^+$ for all $t \in \mathbb{R}$

and $\sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \alpha_j = \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \beta_j$.

Characterization of majorization in l^1

Theorem

Let $\alpha = \{\alpha_j\}, \beta = \{\beta_j\} \in l^1$. Then the following are equivalent

① $\alpha \preceq \beta$







② $\sum_{j=1}^{\infty} (\alpha_j - t)^+ \leq \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} (\beta_j - t)^+, \quad \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} (t - \alpha_j)^+ \leq \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} (t - \beta_j)^+$ for all $t \in \mathbb{R}$

and $\sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \alpha_j = \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \beta_j$.







Corollary

Let $\alpha, \beta \in l^1$ with $\sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \alpha_j = \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \beta_j$. If $\sum_{j=1}^{\infty} g(\alpha_j) \leq \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} g(\beta_j)$ for any convex function g on \mathbb{R} , then $\alpha \preceq \beta$.






References

-  ANDO, T., *Majorization, doubly stochastic matrices, and comparison of eigenvalues*, Linear Algebra Appl. **118** (1989), 163–248.
-  ANDO, T., *Majorizations and inequalities in matrix*, Linear Algebra Appl., **199** (1994), 17-67.
-  W. ARVESON, R.V. KADISON, *Diagonals of self-adjoint operators, in: Operator Theory, Operator Algebras, and Applications, in: Contemp. Math.*, vol. 414, Amer. Math. Soc., Providence, RI, 2006, pp. 247–263.
-  ANTEZANA, J. AND MASSEY, P. AND RUIZ, M. AND STOJANOFF, D., *The Schur-Horn theorem for operators and frames with prescribed norms and frame operator*, Illinois J. Math., **51** (2007) no. 2, 537–560.
-  ARVESON, W. AND KADISON, R.V., *Diagonals of self-adjoint operators, Operator theory, operator algebras, and applications*, Contemp. Math., 414, Amer. Math. Soc., Prov, RI, (2006), 247–263.
-  B. V. RAJARAMA BHAT, ARUP CHATTOPADHYAY, AND G. SANKARA RAJU KOSURU, *On submajorization and eigenvalue inequalities*, Linear Multilinear Algebra., **63** (2015), no. 11, 2245–2253.

References cont...

-  CANOSA, N AND ROSSIGNOLI, R AND PORTESI, M, *Majorization relations and disorder in generalized statistics*, Physica A: Statistical Mechanics and its Applications, **371** (2006), 126-129.
-  DAHL, GEIR, *Majorization and distances in trees*, Networks, An International Journal, **50** (2007), 251–257.
-  GOHBERG, I. C. AND MARKUS, A. S., *Some relations between eigenvalues and matrix elements of linear operators*, Mat. Sb. (N.S.), **64** (106) (1964), 93–123.
-  HARDY, G. H. AND LITTLEWOOD, J. E. AND PÓLYA, G., *Inequalities*, 2d ed, Cambridge, at the University Press, 1952.
-  HORN, ALFRED, *Doubly stochastic matrices and the diagonal of a rotation matrix*, Linear Multilinear Algebra, **76** (1954), 620–630.
-  VICTOR KAFTAL AND GARY WEISS, *An infinite dimensional Schur-Horn theorem and majorization theory*, J. Funct. Anal., **259** (2010), no. 2, 3115–3162.

References cont...

-  JIREH LOREAUX AND GARY WEISS, *Majorization and a Schur-Horn theorem for positive compact operators, the nonzero kernel case*, J. Funct. Anal., **258** (2015), no. 3, 703–731.
-  MARKUS A. S, *Eigenvalues and singular values of the sum and product of linear operators*, Uspehi Mat. Nauk, **19** (1964) no. 4 (118), 93–123.
-  MARSHALL, ALBERT W. AND OLKIN, INGRAM AND ARNOLD, BARRY C., *Inequalities: theory of majorization and its applications*, Springer Series in Statistics, Springer, New York, 2011.
-  NIELSEN, MICHAEL A. AND VIDAL, GUIFRÉ, *Majorization and the interconversion of bipartite states*, Quantum Information & Computation, **1** (2001), 76–93.
-  W. BURNSIDE, *A rapidly convergent series for $\log N!$* , Messenger Math. **46**, 1 (1917), 157–159.

Thank you